JUDGMENT SHEET IN THE HIGH COURT OF BALOCHISTAN QUETTA.

Constitution Petition No.1320/2018

(CC-37609)

Ahmed Ali son of Haider Ali

Vs.

Federation of Pakistan through Secretary Ministry of Interior & others.

Date of hearing <u>30.08.2023</u> Announced on <u>11.09.2023</u>

Petitioner by: M/s Syed Ayaz Zahoor, Aster Mehak & Bakhtiar Khan

Sherani, Advocates.

Respondent

Nos.1, 2 & 3 by: M/s Mian Rauf Atta, Additional Attorney General

alongwith Allauddin Saeed Assistant Attorney General, Muhammad Anwar Naseem Kasi Deputy Attorney General-I assisted by Shehzad Aslam Law Officer Election Commission of Pakistan ('ECP') and

Zahoor Ahmed Mengal Legal Advisor ECP.

Respondent

Nos.4 & 5 by: Mr. Zubair Naseem Khawaja, Law Officer NADRA.

Respondent

No.6 by: Mr. Zahoor Ahmed Baloch, Additional Advocate

General.

JUDGMENT

Naeem Akhtar Afghan, CJ. - This judgment disposes of amended Constitution Petition No.1320/2018.

2. Relevant facts of the case are that Computerized National Identity Card ('CNIC') No.54400-2940230-5 of petitioner and CNIC No.54400-8684813-2 of his wife namely (Zohra Khanum) were cancelled/digitally impounded by respondent No.4 (National Database and Registration Authority/NADRA) vide separate orders dated 22.11.2017 (which according to the petitioner was received by him on 08.03.2018) passed under section 18(1) and 17(2) of the National

Database Registration Authority Ordinance 2000 (hereinafter "the Ordinance of 2000") on the ground that the Law Enforcement Agencies have declared them alien/non-national and they were directed to deposit their CNICs in the nearby office of NADRA within fifteen (15) days.

3. As per contents of the petition, the Regional Level Committee ('RLC') NADRA withdrew the order dated 22.11.2017 with regard to CNIC of the wife of the petitioner being "Pakistani national" but the impugned order dated 22.11.2017 with regard to cancellation/digital impounding of CNIC of petitioner was not withdrawn by RLC NADRA due to which the petitioner filed appeal under section 18 (3) of the Ordinance of 2000 before respondent No.1 (Secretary Ministry of Interior Federation of Pakistan) on 16.03.2018; instead of deciding the appeal of the petitioner on merits, respondent No.1 directed respondent No.4 vide letter dated 19.03.2018 to submit the opinion of respondent No.6 (District Level Committee/DLC) NADRA (presided by Deputy Commissioner Quetta) about national status of the petitioner on urgent basis; in the meanwhile schedule for General Elections 2018 was announced with date of General Elections as 25.07.2018; the petitioner (being Hazara by caste) intended to contest the General Elections as candidate for Balochistan Provincial Assembly from PB-26 Quetta-III but due to cancellation/digital impounding of his CNIC, his name was struck off from the voters list and the pending appeal of the petitioner was not decided by

respondent No.1 due to which the petitioner approached this Court by filing CP No.687/2018 on 01.06.2018.

4. CP No.687/2018 was taken up for preliminary hearing by this Court on 04.06.2018. On the said date notices were issued to the respondents as well as to learned Additional Attorney General and learned Advocate General.

In the above Constitution Petition, the petitioner filed CMA No.1629/2018 for interim order on the grounds that his appeal is pending before respondent No.1; respondent No.1 has referred the matter to respondent No.6 for opinion and it is not known as to how much time will be consumed by respondent No.1 for final decision of appeal/fate of CNIC of the petitioner; the petitioner intends to contest the General Elections of 2018 as candidate for Balochistan Provincial Assembly from PB-26 Quetta-III for which last date for filing of nomination papers has been announced as 08.06.2018.

In view of the above circumstances, interim order dated 07.06.2018 was passed by this Court in CP No.687/2018 whereby the impugned order dated 22.11.2017 (wrongly mentioned as 24.11.2017 in the interim order dated 07.06.2018) passed by respondent No.4 was suspended by this Court till next date.

Despite above interim order dated 07.06.2018 passed by this Court, the nomination papers of the petitioner as candidate from PB-26 Quetta-III were rejected by the Returning Officer vide order dated 19.06.2018 due to cancellation/digitally impounding of his

CNIC against which the petitioner filed Election Appeal No.94/2018 before the Election Appellate Tribunal.

Due to interim order dated 07.06.2018 passed by this Court in favour of petitioner, the Election Appeal No.94/2018 was allowed vide order dated 23.06.2018 and after setting aside the order dated 19.06.2018 passed by the Returning Officer of PB-26 Quetta-III, the nomination papers of the petitioner were accepted and the concerned Returning Officer was directed to revise the list of validly nominated candidates of PB-26 Quetta-III by including the name of the petitioner.

During pendency of CP No.687/2018 the petitioner was directed by this Court to appear before respondent No.6 on 10.07.2018. Respondent No.6 fixed the matter for 17.07.2018 for verification of the antecedents of the petitioner.

On 17.07.2018 Law Officer of respondent No.4 requested this Court to issue directions to respondent No.6 to expedite the proceedings and to decide the matter at the earliest on merits in accordance with law.

7. On 23.07.2018 respondent No.6 transmitted report to the Registrar of this Court that ((بانارم "بافارم"/RG-II of petitioner with reference to his CNIC was sent to respondent No.4 for verification but it has been received "unverified" due to which respondent No.6 has regretted the request of the petitioner and has declared the petitioner as "non-Pakistani".

8. On 25.07.2018, after counting votes, the petitioner was declared as Returned Candidate from PB-26 Quetta-III having secured 6117 votes but his notification as Returned Candidate from PB-26 Quetta-III was not issued by Election Commission of Pakistan ('ECP') and in this regard 02 members of ECP passed short order dated 15.11.2018 with detailed reasons of even date concluding para whereof reads as follows:

"In view of the above said discussion and documentary evidence, we are of the firm view that this is a fit case where the powers of the Commission under article 218(3) should be exercised. As such the election held on 25th July, 2018 in the constituency No.PB-26 Quetta is hereby declared void. In consequence thereof, Mr. Ahmed Ali, returned candidate from constituency No.PB-26 Quetta-III stands disqualified on the ground that he is non-national as reported by M/o Interior, Government of Pakistan. It is hereby directed that reelection be conducted in constituency No.PB-26 Quetta. Office is directed to take follow up action, immediately".

9. CP No.687/2018 was dismissed by this Court vide order dated 07.08.2018 and the interim order dated 07.06.2018 was also recalled by this Court on the grounds that the report of respondent No.6 dated 23.07.2018 placed before this Court is yet to be transmitted to respondent No.1 whereafter the pending appeal of petitioner has to be decided by respondent No.1 on merits; due to pendency of appeal of petitioner before respondent No.1, the relief claimed for by the petitioner in CP No.687/2018 for declaring him an indigenous Pakistani national and for restoration of his CNIC cannot be granted by this Court at this stage in constitutional jurisdiction as

findings of this Court on merits at this stage may cause prejudice to either of the parties in appeal pending before respondent No.1.

10. Vide letter dated 04.09.2018, respondent No.6 conveyed the following opinion to respondent No.4 and to respondent No.1 about the status of the petitioner:

"SUBJECT: - <u>APPEAL UNDER SECTION 18(3) OF</u>
<u>THE NADRA ORDINANCE 2000 IN</u>
<u>RESPECT OF MR. AHMED ALI S/O</u>
<u>HAIDER ALI CNIC NO:54400-2940230-5.</u>

Reference is drawn to the Letter No:8/8/2018-Nadra dated 27th August, 2018.

- 2. In continuation of above mentioned Letter number the matter was again deliberated discussed in the meeting of DLC. All the agencies have unanimously declared Ahmed Ali Kohzad as Non National on the basis of following facts:
 - ➤ The RG-II form provided by Ahmed Ali Kohzad is fake as it could not be verified by NADRA.
 - According to the affidavit submitted by the applicant in 1997, Ahmed Ali Kohzad's parents died in 1977. But, unfortunately, his date of Birth is 1979.
 - He was also required to produce his brother so that his case could be strengthened but the applicant failed to produce stating that he was in Sweden.
 - Moreover, during personal hearing, applicant stated that his father had died in 2008 and mother had died in 2013 which is in clear contradiction to what applicant has stated in the affidavit submitted in 1997.

Based on the above mentioned facts, Ahmed Ali Kohzad does not hold Nationality of Pakistan and is Afghan National."

- 11. On the basis of above opinion, the appeal filed by the petitioner under section 18(3) of the Ordinance of 2000 was dismissed by respondent No.1 vide impugned order dated 24.10.2018 operating paras whereof read as follows:
 - "5. During the personal hearing proceedings the appellant was asked to produce any document prior to 1979 in light of Ministry of Interior Notification dated

- 19th April 2017. However, appellant failed to produce any documentary evidence to prove his Pakistani Nationality.
- 6. After hearing the appellant and perusal of record submitted by NADRA, following discrepancies were observed:
 - a. According to RG-II available against MNIC No 601-57-215491 issued to Abdul Hameed in 1977, no link found which can establish relation of appellant with MNIC holder. Further, MNIC holder registered himself with deceased father namely Haider Ali at the time of registration in 1977.
 - b. The parent of appellant died before 1977 as per Affidavit submitted by Mr. Ahmad Ali in 1997. However, during personal hearing the appellant claimed that his father died in 2008 and his mother died in 2013.
 - c. The appellant claimed that name of Mr. Abdul Majeed S/o Haider Ali was mistakenly printed by NADRA instead of Mr. Abdul Hameed who is his real brother. However, as of NADRA record CNIC No.54400-7916610-5 was issued to Mr. Abdul Majeed in the year 2002 expired in 2007 marked as system independent (no family linkage in database). Further, Mr. Abdul Majeed was issued CNIC No.54400-79166105 in 2002 on the basis of MNIC No.601-57-215491 issued to Mr. Abdul Hameed in 1977.
- 7. After long deliberation, the matter was remanded to DLC, Quetta and verifying agency for reverification in order to reach a just conclusion. DLC, Quetta thereby submitted fresh report on 04.09.2018 stating therein that all the agencies have unanimously declared the appellant as Non National.
- 8. Another personal hearing was also granted to the appellant on 18.09.2018. The appellant appeared before the appellate authority and again could not produce any documentary evidence prior to 1979.
- 9. Verifying agency also submitted its report on 19.10.2018 stating therein that on 04.09.2018, DC, Quetta summoned meeting of DICC (District Intelligence Coordination Committee) comprising all concerned authorities. In the said meeting the case was re-analyzed wherein, all the members of DICC unanimously declared the appellant as Non National.
- 10. On the basis of facts stated above, scrutiny of record, personal hearing proceedings and re-verification reports of DLC, Quetta and verifying agency, the instant appeal is dismissed".

12. The petitioner challenged the order dated 22.11.2017 passed by respondent No.4 and order dated 24.10.2018 passed by respondent No.1 before Islamabad High Court by filing Writ Petition No.4101/2018 which was dismissed in limine on 29.10.2018 by Single Bench of Islamabad High Court without touching merits of the case for want of jurisdiction whereafter the petitioner filed the instant Constitution Petition before this Court on 03.11.2018 (amended on 22.04.2019) claiming the following relief:

"It is accordingly respectfully prayed that this Hon'ble Court may kindly be pleased to accept the petition in favour of the petitioner and against the respondents by declaring:

- a) That the act of the respondents in declaring the petitioner to be non-national is contrary to the laws, rules as well as violative of the guarantees available to the petitioner under the Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973 be declared as such;
- b) Further declaring that the order dated 24.10.2018 passed by the respondent No.2 and the order dated 22.11.2017 passed by the respondent Nos.4 and 5/NADRA Authorities be declared as having been passed in excess and mis-exercise of jurisdiction vested in the respondents, therefore, the same being totally illegal, improper, bad in the eye of law liable to be declared as such;
- c) Further the order dated 22.11.2017 passed by the respondents Nos.4 and 5/NADRA Authorities and the order dated 24.10.2018 passed by respondent No.2 be set aside and the status of the petitioner as citizen of Pakistan be restored;
- d) Further the order dated 15.11.2018 passed by the Election Commission of Pakistan, on the basis of order dated 24.10.2018 passed by respondent No.2 wherein the petitioner was declared as nonnational, be declared as totally without lawful authority and jurisdiction be set aside by restoring the nationality of the petitioner as Pakistani;
- e) Any other relief which this Hon'ble Court may deem fit and proper in the circumstances of the

case may also be awarded in favour of the petitioner, in the interest of justice, fair play and equity".

- 13. Respondent No.4 and respondent No.5 (Regional Director General NADRA Balochistan) have contested the petition by filing joint parawise comments. Respondent No.1 (Federation of Pakistan through Secretary Ministry of Interior Islamabad), respondent No.2 (Additional Secretary Ministry of Interior Islamabad), respondent No.3 (Election Commission of Pakistan) and respondent No.6 (Deputy Commissioner/President DLC) have contested the petition on the basis of available record.
- 14. It is the case of the petitioner that being illiterate, his parents neither got themselves registered with the Directorate General of Registration nor they obtained the National Identity Cards of Pakistan during their lifetime due to which after their death, his elder brother Abdul Hameed got entered his name in the record of Directorate General of Registration and availed Manual Identify Card (MNIC) bearing No.601-57-215491; subsequently, being elder of the Family, he got entered the names of the petitioner, his brothers Muhammad Ali, Inayatullah, his sister-in-law Johar Begum wife of Muhammad Ali, his nephews Muhammad Jawad son of Muhammad Ali, Qudratullah son of Muhammad Ali and his niece Marzia daughter of Muhammad Ali and Zohra Begum daughter of Muhammad Ali in (("فارم" افارم"/RG-II as members of his Family; his brother Inayatullah got issued his MNIC bearing No.601-74-432185, his brother Muhammad Ali got issued his MNIC bearing No.601-92-432185; subsequently his

brothers also got issued their CNICs from NADRA; the petitioner completed his primary, Secondary and Higher Education in Quetta; he got issued local certificate of Quetta; he was elected as Nazim Chiltan Town (Union Council-60) due to which he was issued Identity Card dated 22.10.2009 by ECP; he contested the election for Member of Provincial Assembly from PB-26 Quetta-III and obtained 6117 votes but he was not notified as Returned Candidate due to cancellation /digitally impounding of his CNIC and due to pendency of his appeal before respondent No.1; the forums below have wrongly refused restoration of his CNIC; the documents available on record have not been properly appreciated by the forums below; affidavit dated 29.03.1997, on the basis whereof the petitioner has been denied relief by the forums below, has not been sworn by him; he is a Pakistani national but he has wrongly been declared as "non-Pakistani" by the forums below.

Pakistani", has rightly been cancelled/digitally impounded by NADRA; while refusing relief to the petitioner for restoration of his CNIC and for declaring him "Pakistan national", the forums below have not committed any illegality or irregularity; the petitioner is a "non-Pakistani" and as such the CNIC having been fraudulently obtained from NADRA by the petitioner cannot be restored.

- 16. While supporting the impugned orders, learned Additional Attorney General adopted the arguments of Law Officer NADRA.
- 17. After hearing learned counsel for the parties at length, we have perused the entire record.

According to the Notification dated 19.04.2017 issued by the Ministry of Interior Government of Pakistan in exercise of powers conferred u/s 47 of the Ordinance of 2000, on the recommendations of the Parliamentary Committee, the blocked/cancelled CNICs have to be cleared/restored if the applicant provides one or more of the following documents:

- 1) Land record registered prior to 1978 (verified by Revenue Dept.)
- 2) Local/Domicile Certificate issued prior to 1978 and verified by issuing authority
- 3) Pedigree (Shajra-e-Nasab) issued & verified by Revenue Dept.
- 4) Government employment certificate (or of blood relative), employed before 1990
- 5) Verified educational certificates (issued prior to 1978)
- 6) Passport issued to applicant prior to 1978

7) Any other document issued by Government of Pakistan prior to 1978 and verified by issuing authority (including Arm License, Driving License or Manual NIC issued prior to 1978 duly verified by record)

The year "1978" mentioned in the above Notification was ordered to be read as "1979" by making amendment in the above Notification by Government of Pakistan Ministry of Interior vide Notification dated 03.01.2018.

- 18. We have gone through the original ((بانفارم "بافارم" /RG-II forms of petitioner as well as of Abdul Hameed which reveal that Abdul Hameed son of Haider Ali (claimed to be as elder brother by the petitioner) got issued his MNIC bearing No.601-57-215491 on 28.05.1977 on the basis of ((بانفارم "بالفارم" /RG-II dated 24.05.1977 and (فارم "الفارم" /RG-I dated 26.05.1977. In column No.1 of the original ((بافارم "الفارم" /RG-II dated 24.05.1977 only the name of Abdul Hameed appears as son of Haider Ali. In column No.6 of the original (بافارم "الفارم" /RG-I dated 26.05.1977 Abdul Hameed has mentioned the name of his father as "حيدر على مرحوم" which reveals that Haider Ali (claimed to be his father by the petitioner) had died prior to 26.05.1977 i.e. before obtaining MNIC No.601-57-215491 dated 28.05.1977 by Abdul Hameed.
- 19. Record transpires that there are three ((افارم "بافارم" /RG-II forms containing the name of petitioner, Muhammad Ali and Inayatullah as sons of Haider Ali and it also contain the names of Johar Begum wife of Muhammad Ali, Muhammad Jawad son of Muhammad Ali, Qudratullah son of Muhammad Ali Bibi Marzia

daughter of Muhammad Ali and Bibi Zohra Begum daughter of Muhammad Ali.

In (("فارم"/RG-II bearing Sr. No.046124 dated 19.11.1995, the date of birth of petitioner has been mentioned as 16.02.1979 with cutting on the figures of the year.

In ((بانی الله "RG-II bearing Sr. No.046123 dated 20.11.1995, the date of birth of petitioner mentioned as 01.08.1979 has been cut and it has been written as 16.02.1979.

In 3^{rd} (("فارم" فارم"/RG-II dated 06.08.1998, the date of birth of petitioner has been mentioned as 01.08.1979.

- 21. Since as per entry in column No.6 of his ("فارم")/RG-I dated 26.05.1977 Abdul Hameed has mentioned his father as "حيدر على مرحوم" and as per contents of the affidavit dated 29.03.1977 of the petitioner, his parents had died prior to 1977,

therefore question arises as to how the date of birth of petitioner can be 16.02.1979 (as claimed by the petitioner in all his testimonials).

22. The (("افارم"/RG-II forms of the petitioner with reference to Abdul Hameed son of Haider Ali have been found "unverified" by respondent No.6 in the record of NADRA.

According to record of NADRA, ((بان) قارم الهربة /RG-II available against MNIC No.601-57-215491 issued to Abdul Hameed in 1977 does not provide any link to establish relationship of the petitioner with the MNIC holder Abdul Hameed.

- According to NADRA record, Abdul Hameed son of Haider Ali was also subsequently issued CNIC bearing No. 54400-7916610-5 dated 22.11.2002 by the name of "Abdul Majeed son of Haider Ali" with expiry date of 31.10.2007 which has been marked as "system independent" (i.e. having no family linkage in database).
- Abdul Hameed son of Haider Ali (mentioned in CNIC as Abdul Majeed) never applied for correction of his name in CNIC or for renewal of his CNIC and he never appeared before any forum in favour of petitioner to assert that the petitioner is his real brother.

According to petitioner, Abdul Hameed son of Haider Ali (mentioned as Abdul Majeed in CNIC) has proceeded abroad.

25. The petitioner also did not produce Inayatullah and Muhammad Ali before the forums below in support of his contention and to prove his relationship of real brother with them as well as with Abdul Hameed (mentioned in CNIC as Abdul Majeed).

- 26. In the record of NADRA, the petitioner has mentioned the name of his mother as "Zubaida Begum" while his alleged brother Muhammad Ali has mentioned the name of his mother as "Bibi" whereas his alleged brother Inayatullah has mentioned the name of his mother as "Fatima". It is not the case of petitioner that his father had contracted three marriages. The petitioner has failed to furnish any explanation in the above regard.
- 27. The instant Constitution Petition is annexed with affidavits dated 23.11.2022 of Inayatullah and Muhammad Ali stating therein that the name of their mother is "Mst. Zubaida Begum" but they both have never filed any application for correction of the name of their mother in the record of NADRA.
- 28. In contradiction to the contents of (افارم الف)/RG-I of Abdul Hameed dated 26.05.1977 mentioning the name of his father as "حيدر على مرحوم" and in contradiction to the contents of his attested affidavit dated 29.03.1997 wherein the petitioner has mentioned that his parents had died prior to year 1977, during personal hearing before DLC, the petitioner has stated that his father died in year 2008 and his mother had died in year 2013.

If the above statement of petitioner is believed, there is no explanation as to why the parents of the petitioner did not avail their MNICs as well as CNICs in their lifetime and as to why during lifetime of Haider Ali (claimed to be his father by the petitioner), Abdul Hameed was shown in ((ناب) الحال (RG-II dated 19.11.1995, 20.11.1995 and 06.08.1998 as elder of the Family.

- 29. It is pertinent to mention here that apart from being indigenous residents of Quetta (Balochistan), the members of Hazara community, having similar face features, are also indigenous residents of Afghanistan. In number of cases, the members of Hazara community migrating to Pakistan from Afghanistan got themselves inserted as members of family of indigenous Hazara residents of Quetta (by intruding in their Family Tree) due to which they succeeded in getting Pakistani Identity Card by manipulation with the connivance of the concerned staff of the then Directorate General of Registration /presently NADRA and on the basis of same they are also issued local certificate. The same is the case of the petitioner.
- 30. The school leaving certificates dated 15.04.1995 and 23.09.1995, birth certificate dated 29.07.2004 got issued from Medical Officer of Zarghoon Town Quetta with date of birth of petitioner as 16.02.1979, issuance of local certificate dated 04.12.2003 of Quetta District, Secondary School Certificate dated 27.10.1999 of Balochistan Board of Intermediate & Secondary Education ('BBISE') Quetta, Higher Secondary Certificate dated 29.03.2001 of BBISE, Transcript of Bachelor Study dated 11.06.2001 of University of Balochistan ('UoB'), purchase of 3000 sq.ft. of land in Mouza Kirani, Tappa Shadenzai District Quetta in the year 2008, Detail Marks Sheet dated 12.03.2018 of MA Persian issued by UoB and (('\(\psi\)''|\(\psi\)''/RG-II dated 19.11.1995, 20.11.1995 and 06.08.1998 with name of Abdul Hameed as elder brother do not entitle the petitioner for restoration of his CNIC and for declaring him as "Pakistani national" as despite

availing full and fair opportunities before all the forums of NADRA, the petitioner has failed to produce a single document prior to the year 1979 to show/prove that he is a "Pakistani national".

31. In view of all the above, it is concluded that the petitioner is a "non-Pakistani"; he succeeded in availing CNIC from NADRA by manipulation, by wrongly intruding in the Family Tree of Abdul Hameed/by wrongly inserting his name as son of Haider Ali (late) and as brother of Abdul Hameed in ((بانارم الله)/RG-II dated 19.11.1995, 20.11.1995 and 06.08.1998.

It is further concluded that the order dated 22.11.2017 of NADRA for digital impounding/cancellation of CNIC of the petitioner, the report dated 23.07.2018 of respondent No.6, opinion of respondent No.6 conveyed to respondent No.1 vide letter dated 04.09.2018, the impugned order dated 24.10.2018 passed by respondent No.1, the impugned order dated 15.11.2018 of ECP and refusal of all the forums below for restoration of CNIC of the petitioner and their refusal to declare the petitioner as "Pakistani national" are not suffering from any illegality or irregularity warranting interference by this Court in constitutional jurisdiction.

For the above reasons, the Constitution Petition is dismissed.

Announced in open Court on 11th September 2023

CHIEF JUSTICE

JUDGE.